

Exercise walk-through

1.1

Premises and personhood: supported rehearsal

International Baccalaureate · IB Diploma · Philosophy · HL

Premises and personhood: method

Premises and personhood: method

A premise gives a reason; a conclusion is the claim those reasons aim to support.

Validity concerns whether true premises would guarantee the conclusion.

Soundness also requires true premises. A definition of personhood must be argued for and tested, not assumed from everyday wording.

Premises and personhood: reasoning

Premises and personhood: reasoning

The argument has the valid denying-the-consequent form if the first premise is accepted. The premise is highly contestable: temporary inability to speak is a counterexample to using verbal performance as a necessary condition.

A valid form does not establish soundness.

Premises and personhood: transfer review

Premises and personhood: transfer review

A consciousness criterion can link personhood to experience, but its necessity, sufficiency and meaning need argument. Temporary unconsciousness challenges a momentary test, and other minds raise evidential problems.

Distinguish the concept from a performance proxy and consider a defensible revision.

Exercises 2.1·3.1

2.1 For the worked case, identify the evidence and a conclusion it can support. Explain one material limit. [3]

3.1 Propose consciousness as a personhood criterion and identify a difficulty in applying it. Give a reasoned answer, evidence or method, and a relevant qualification. [3]

Exercises 2.1-3.1

2.1 For the worked case, identify the evidence and a conclusion it can support. Explain one material limit. [3]

2.1 The argument has the valid denying-the-consequent form if the first premise is accepted. The premise is highly contestable: temporary inability to speak is a counterexample to using verbal performance as a necessary condition. A valid form does not establish soundness. Authored points for identifying relevant evidence, explaining a supported inference and a material limit.

3.1 Propose consciousness as a personhood criterion and identify a difficulty in applying it. Give a reasoned answer, evidence or method, and a relevant qualification. [3]

3.1 A consciousness criterion can link personhood to experience, but its necessity, sufficiency and meaning need argument. Temporary unconsciousness challenges a momentary test, and other minds raise evidential problems. Distinguish the concept from a performance proxy and consider a defensible revision. Authored points for a relevant judgement, reason tied to the case and justified qualification or method. Accept a supported alternative.