

Exercise walk-through

Selecting relevant and sufficient evidence ■ 8.9

eXercise

You must be able to

- state the conditions for effectiveness and sufficiency
- explain what sufficiency means in a fourteen-line poem
- name the six purposes evidence serves
- avoid the two opposite faults

Method — Conditions

Effective: commentary explains a logical relationship between evidence and claim.

Sufficient: quantity and quality provide apt support for the line of reasoning.

Method — In a short poem

There is little text, so sufficiency is nearly always about **quality**: the right three words, closely read, outweigh six loosely gestured at.

Method — Six purposes

Illustrate, clarify, exemplify, associate, amplify, or qualify.

Method — Two faults

Too little: one quotation carrying an essay's whole claim. **Too much:** quoting most of a short poem, which leaves nothing for the commentary to be about. Both fail sufficiency from opposite directions.

Practice 2.1 ■ 2 marks

State the conditions for effectiveness and sufficiency.

Solution 2.1

Worked steps

effective when commentary explains a logical relationship between evidence and claim **B1**; sufficient when quantity and quality aptly support the line of reasoning **B1**.

Practice 2.2 ■ 2 marks

Explain what sufficiency usually means in a short poem.

Solution 2.2

Worked steps

quality rather than quantity **B1**, since the right few words closely read outweigh many loosely gestured at **B1**.

Practice 2.3 ■ 2 marks

There are two opposite faults.

(a) Name them.

(b) State why quoting most of a short poem fails.

Solution 2.3

Method: Two faults

Worked steps

(a) too little — one quotation carrying the whole claim **B1**; too much — quoting most of the poem **B1**. (b) it leaves nothing for the commentary to be about **B1**.

Exam-style 3.1 ■ 1 mark

In a short poem, sufficiency is usually about

A quality

B quantity

C length

D rhyme

Solution 3.1

A quality



B quantity

C length

D rhyme

Worked steps

A. quality.

Exam-style 3.2 ■ 1 mark

Quoting most of a short poem leaves nothing for

A the commentary to be about

B the thesis

C the title

D the reader

Solution 3.2

Method: Two faults

A the commentary to be about



B the thesis

C the title

D the reader

Worked steps

A. the commentary.

Exam-style 3.3 ■ 1 mark

An essay on a fourteen-line poem quotes ten of the lines.

- (a) State the fault.
- (b) Explain the fix.

Solution 3.3

Method: Two faults

Worked steps

(a) too much evidence and too little commentary **B1**. (b) cut to the two or three phrases the claim actually rests on **B1** and use the space to explain what those phrases do **B1**.